



County Hall
Cardiff
CF10 4UW
Tel: (029) 2087 2000

Neuadd y Sir
Caerdydd
CF10 4UW
Ffôn: (029) 2087 2000

AGENDA

Pwyllgor PWYLLGOR CRAFFU'R ECONOMI A DIWYLLIANT

Dyddiad ac amser y cyfarfod DYDD IAU, 11 HYDREF 2018, 5.00 PM

Lleoliad YSTAFELL BWYLLGOR 4 - NEUADD Y SIR

Aelodaeth Cynghorydd Howells (Cadeirydd)
Y Cynghorwyr Henshaw, Gordon, Gavin Hill-John, Parkhill, Robson,
Sattar, Simmons a/ac Stubbs

Tua
Amser.

1 Ymddiheuriadau am Absenoldeb

Derbyn ymddiheuriadau am absenoldeb.

2 Datganiadau o Fuddiant

Dylid gwneud hyn ar ddechrau'r eitem agenda dan sylw, yn unol â'r Cod Ymddygiad Aelodau.

3 Cofnodion (Tudalennau 3 - 8)

Cymeradwyo cofnodion y cyfarfod blaenorol fel rhai cywir.

4 Ailddatblygu Dumballs Road (Tudalennau 9 - 16)

5.00 pm

Cael cyflwyniad gan Vastint, yn nodi eu cynigion ar gyfer ailddatblygu'r safle, gyda phwyslais penodol ar unedau masnachol, cyfleoedd cyflogaeth ac hyfforddiant, a gofod cymunedol, ac yna sesiwn cwestiwn ac ateb gyda phawb sy'n mynychu. Mae gan Aelodau ddiddordeb hefyd yng nghyfraniad ariannol y Cyngor, a'r broses gyd-gysylltu gyda busnesau presennol a chymorth i symud i leoliadau priodol eraill.

5 Ymateb y Cabinet i'r Ymchwiliad 'Ariannu Parciau' (Tudalennau 17 - 32)

6.00 pm

Derbyn Ymateb y Cabinet i Adroddiad Grŵp Gorchwyl y Pwyllgor ar Ariannu Parciau.

6 **Busnes y Pwyllgor** (*Tudalennau 33 - 38*) 6.30 pm

7 **Y Ffordd Ymlaen** 6.45 pm

Adolygu'r dystiolaeth a'r wybodaeth a gasglwyd yn ystod y gwaith o ystyried pob eitem ar yr agenda, cytuno y dylid anfon sylwadau a phryderon Aelodau ymlaen at yr Aelod Cabinet perthnasol gan y Cadeirydd, a nodi eitemau i'w cynnwys ar Flaenraglen Waith y Pwyllgor.

8 **Materion Brys (os o gwbl)**

9 **Dyddiad y cyfarfod nesaf.**

8 Tachwedd 2018, Ystafell Bwyllgor 4, Neuadd y Sir, Caerdydd.

Davina Fiore

Cyfarwyddwr Llywodraethu a Gwasanaethau Cyfreithiol

Dyddiad: Dydd Gwener, 5 Hydref 2018

Cyswllt: Andrea Redmond, 02920 872434, a.redmond@caerdydd.gov.uk

ECONOMY & CULTURE SCRUTINY COMMITTEE

13 SEPTEMBER 2018

Present: Councillor Howells(Chairperson)
Councillors Henshaw, Gavin Hill-John, Parkhill, Robson, Sattar
and Stubbs

11 : APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE

Apologies for absence were received from Councillors Gordon and Simmons.
Councillor Stubbs advised that he would be late arriving.

12 : DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

None.

13 : MINUTES

The minutes of the meeting held on 14 June 2018 were agreed as a correct record
and signed by the Chairperson.

14 : UPDATE ON COMMITTEE MEMBERSHIP

The Chairperson welcomed Councillor Jane Henshaw to the Committee.

15 : INNOVATION PREMISES

The Chairperson welcomed Mark Jackson, University of South Wales – Director of
Design and Digital to the meeting and advised that the Committee are currently
engaged in an inquiry looking at what the Council role should be regarding the
provision of workshops and innovation premises. The Chairperson stated that the
Committee would be interested to hear Mark Jackson's perspective on this, the work
that his university is doing in this area and what he thinks the Council role should be.

The Chairperson explained that whilst this was a formal setting, it was intended to be
more of a conversation than a formal Q&A session, so contributions and suggestions
of topics and areas that may not have been directly asked about were welcome.
Mark Jackson explained that in his role as Director of Design and Digital he was
responsible for courses such as Design, Illustration, Fashion, Photography and
Computer Games design, with over 1500 students, mostly from around Wales. It
was hoped that students would stay in Cardiff after graduation, all students were now
on one campus which was very positive and upbeat, currently there was the highest
satisfaction scores ever received and there was lots of excitement around innovation
and investment.

It was noted that students are very involved with creative industries, which are based
primarily in the City Centre and Bay area and consequently students stay mainly in
that geographical area as the infrastructure and support mechanisms are already
there and are quite restricted to that part of the City.

Mark Jackson noted that the potential innovation and workshop spaces run by Cardiff were out of this area and are not so suitable for his students for the following reasons: students don't have transport; they like the localised contact with their lecturers; and the University is committed to supporting their Alumni as long as they need it. He added that after graduation, students can often have a difficult few months and they use the University Campus to embed ideas and use the support of staff over the summer before the undergraduates arrive. They need digital space as they work primarily from their laptops and mobiles. Currently some students use the Tramshed, WeWork, and locations in the Bay, some rent spaces in shared spaces and coffee shops. Spaces are needed for access to knowledge and hold conversations, even if these are digital; occasionally physical space is needed for 3D printers etc. However, what is really important is space to access knowledge.

The Chairperson invited questions and comments from Members.

Members asked what the University's view of Cardiff was in relation to creativity and innovation. Mark Jackson considered that it was the best it has ever been, it felt exciting and tangible to students with an energy that suits the creative sector. He added that he felt for the first time things were in line between Education and the Industry. He considered that Cardiff's social scene fits student life, and he had received very positive feedback from Overseas Students. He considered that students felt happy and confident in the City and there was a feel of something exciting happening. Students who commute rather than live in Cardiff however do have a different experience.

Members asked how much more innovation and workshop space was needed in the geographical area to help students when they first start-up businesses. Mark Jackson stated it more about the location of spaces, spaces around Cardiff wouldn't work, there needed to be in the area between the University Campus and the Bay, this cluster and community drives innovation in a way that it may not in other sectors. The students are often working on their own and they need to be with other creative people to have a synergy, they also work on a different model, working evenings and having less of a gap between their social and work life.

Members asked what was needed to support Innovation, such as funding mechanisms etc. Mark Jackson stated that young people are very creative, the challenge comes with taking that creativity and commercialising it into a tangible income; that's where it becomes business. Business advice speaking a creative language was needed. There was lots of support provided from the Council, Banks and University Sector but what was needed was mentoring to take the students to these introductions and beyond, to provide advice to businesses about how to expand and consolidate. He added that networking events were buoyant in Cardiff at the moment and this has built up over the past 2 years.

Members asked if the mentoring would be better provided by the University or an outside body. Mark Jackson considered it could be both but as students have to leave the University at some point, not all support should be provided by them. It would be good to have successful creatives mentoring start-up creatives as it is often 2 to 3 years in that a business needs more advice.

Members asked what the reason was for the corridor from the University to the Bay. Mark Jackson explained that the students see a line down to the Tramshed from Central Square and see this as the pathway to the Bay, he considered this would be accentuated when the BBC move in. He added that every year the students hold exhibitions and the venues for these have moved from the City Centre to the Bay area as they consider the type of people who would attend are those based in the creative areas based in the Bay area.

Members asked if there was a role for the Council to provide premises for the students to use and if so what would they look like. Mark Jackson stated that the number of spaces on the list surprised him and that he doesn't know the spaces and considered his students wouldn't engage with them. He did however want to support the link with the Council but the spaces needed to be targeted in terms of location, which he understood was very difficult as the area was prime land. He added that he has the same thing happen elsewhere and as areas become gentrified the creative industries move out.

Members asked if the Council had a role in facilitating greater networks and/ or mentoring. Mark Jackson stated that the Council does work collaboratively with Universities in a way they didn't previously. He added that quite often the people who do volunteer to be mentors don't have a connection with creative industries and this makes it difficult for them to add value or speak the same language as creatives. Theoretically, the Council could support networking events, but it may be difficult as most of these tend to be informal, pop-up events in bars and coffee shops. Members asked how the Council, business and Welsh Government could work better to support innovation. Mark Jackson explained that often students don't understand the difference between the Council and Welsh Government, so this difference needs to be more visible. There also needs to be more engagement and involvement in curriculum development.

Members asked from Mark Jackson's experiences at other Universities, if he has seen how other Local Authorities support Innovation. Mark Jackson stated that he attends conferences and looks at best practice. In Bath old factory units were provided as start-up units for Art Practitioners when they left University. In Manchester and Leeds old warehouses were given as free spaces, but this was years ago and it was the right time and the right energy and synergy was present and the Councils had these spaces available.

Members asked what makes undergraduates leave the City. Mark Jackson explained that it was the cost of living when they left University, quite often students are staying in Halls of Residence for the full 3 years of the course and they can't afford to live in the City when they graduate.

Members asked if Cardiff was losing entrepreneurs and potential wealth generators as a result of this. Mark Jackson said yes potentially as for some students when they graduate, they move home to family and the creative bubble can burst.

The Chairperson thanked Mark Jackson for attending and for his contributions stating that these will help the Committee to shape its final report on these issues, which it is

planning to bring to Committee in October. The Chairperson added that Committee will send the notes of the meeting to him so that he has the opportunity to check them for accuracy.

16 : WORK PROGRAMMING AND WEBCASTING

Members were advised that this item enables Committee to consider whether any further amendments are required to its draft work programme and to identify which items they feel warrant webcasting.

The Scrutiny Officer took Members through the work programme, outlining any amendments that had been made since the work programming forum held in July and updating Members on each issue.

With regards to webcasting, Members looked at each topic and considered that the following topics are of public interest and should be webcast:

Historic Assets; Economic Development White Paper; Indoor Arena; Bus Station; GLL; Metro and City Deal

RESOLVED to:

- I. formally approve the work programme
- II. formally approve the nominations for the task groups as Cllr Howells, Cllr G Hill-John and Cllr Robson for the Workshops and Innovation task group and Cllrs Henshaw, Gordon and Parkhill for the Events Inquiry.
- III. take the list of items to webcast to discuss with the other Scrutiny Chairs, Head of Democratic Services and Head of Communications.

17 : PERFORMANCE: BRIEFING PAPER - ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT

The Chairperson advised that this report gives Members the opportunity to consider the economic development performance indicators reported to some other core cities and to consider the way forward regarding economic development performance monitoring.

The Scrutiny Officer reminded Members that in a previous committee they had noted that the number of indicators had reduced for 2018/19 and Members had been advised that this was to do with the work that the Council can directly influence. The Scrutiny Officer had been tasked to look at what indicators other Local Authorities use.

The report outlined comparable core cities that had been grouped in similarity to Cardiff. Members were advised that Cardiff was not missing any categories but may want to look at the substance of the information provided.

It was agreed that Members would consider the information in Appendix A to the report and provide feedback to the Chairperson who would then start discussions with Economic Development officers about the information that would be of real use going forward.

18 : URGENT ITEMS (IF ANY)

None.

19 : DATE OF NEXT MEETING

The next meeting of the Economy and Culture Scrutiny Committee is scheduled for 11 October 2018 at 5.00pm in Committee Room 4, County Hall.

The meeting terminated at 6.25 pm

This page is intentionally left blank

**CYNGOR CAERDYDD
CARDIFF COUNCIL****ECONOMY & CULTURE SCRUTINY COMMITTEE****11 OCTOBER 2018**

DUMBALLS ROAD REGENERATION: Progress Report

Purpose of Report

1. To provide background information to prepare Members for their scrutiny of proposals to regenerate the Dumballs Road area. Members will receive a presentation from Vastint, the company leading the regeneration.

Scope of Scrutiny

2. This item provides Members with the opportunity to explore issues relating to the proposed redevelopment of the Dumballs Road site, with a particular emphasis on commercial units, employment & training opportunities and community space¹. Members also have the opportunity to explore the contribution of the scheme to the wider economy of Cardiff, for example by improving transport routes between the city centre and Cardiff Bay, thus benefiting tourism and trade. In addition, Members have indicated that they are interested in scrutinising both the financial contribution of the Council to the regeneration and the liaison process with existing businesses located in Dumballs Road, including those that need to move from the site.

Background

3. The Dumballs Road site is a circa 40 acres brownfield site, south of Central Train Station and Callaghan Square, allocated in the Local Development Plan

¹ The proposals relating to affordable housing do not fall within the remit of this Committee, as housing comes under the terms of reference of the Community & Adult Services Scrutiny Committee.

for housing-led mixed-use developments. It falls within the Cardiff Central Enterprise Zone, established by Welsh Government in 2013 with a particular focus on the financial and professional advisory services.

4. Enterprise Zones are geographic areas that benefit from additional support and incentives for business infrastructure, to attract businesses and stimulate economic growth and prosperity. Examples of the support available include financial incentives (grants, loans and business rate reductions), simplified and efficient planning processes, access to local academia and high-speed broadband.
5. The National Assembly for Wales Economy, Infrastructure and Skills Committee recently completed an Inquiry into Enterprise Zones². This heard that projects in the Cardiff Central Enterprise Zone include:
 - inward investments from Deloitte and Alert Logic;
 - relocations into the zone from Admiral, BBC and HMRC;
 - a new further education college for Cardiff and Vale;
 - expansion for the University of South Wales - Atrium 2 and 3;
 - Proposed new creative campus from Cardiff Met University and from Cardiff University for a new school of journalism.
6. The National Assembly for Wales Economy, Infrastructure and Skills Committee Inquiry heard that the Board of Cardiff Central Enterprise Zone was content with the Welsh Government's proposal to wind it up, and the Committee likewise gave their support for this to take place; a decision on this is awaited.

Regenerating Dumballs Road

7. On 1 December 2016, Cabinet received a report³ setting out proposals from Vastint⁴ to regenerate the area, delivering up to 2,000 new homes, including

² 'Enterprise Zones: Boldly Going?' May 2018 – available at www.assembly.wales

³ Available at: <http://cardiff.moderngov.co.uk/mgAi.aspx?ID=7214&LLL=0>

⁴ Vastint is the property arm of the IKEA group

affordable housing, commercial use and community use and providing jobs during the construction phase and beyond.

8. The 1 December 2016 Cabinet report highlights the primary issues facing regeneration of Dumballs Road, which are complicated land ownership arrangements and site abnormalities. To assist with this, the report sought permission for the Council to purchase 12.6 acres of the site and work in partnership with Vastint to develop a master plan, with Heads of Terms and a Memorandum of Understanding underpinning this. The report to Cabinet also sought permission to dispose of a council building at Bessemer Close to provide a suitable relocation site for a business from the Dumballs Road area.

9. Following consideration of the report, including confidential information and a presentation by Vastint, Cabinet agreed that:

'1) The Heads of Terms attached as Appendix 4 be approved.

2) Authority be delegated to the Director of Economic Development in consultation with the Leader of the Council, the Cabinet Member for Corporate Services and Performance, the Corporate Director Resources, and the Director of Governance and Legal Services to:

i) Conclude the acquisition of 8.5 acres of land at Dumballs Road as illustrated at Appendix 2 and in accordance with the Heads of Terms attached as Appendix 4.

ii) Negotiate and conclude the acquisition of a further 4.1 acres of land at Dumballs Road as illustrated at Appendix 2 with the final cost of acquisition subject to allocated budgets and approval by an independent valuer.

iii) Dispose of the former Depot Building at Bessemer Close to enable the relocation of a business from the Dumballs Road area as illustrated in the plan at Appendix 5 and in accordance with the independent valuation at Appendix 6.

3) The receipt from the disposal of the former Depot Building at Bessemer Close be ring fenced to enhance the allocated capital budget being used to acquire the land at Dumballs Road outlined in this report and illustrated in Appendix 2.

4) that the required level of capital allocation from the Central Enterprise Zone (CEZ) budget is brought forward from future years to the current financial year, as set out in Appendix 8.'

10. Since then, the Council has worked with Vastint in developing a comprehensive approach to the regeneration of the area, which is a requirement of the Local Planning Authority given the strategic location of the site. The Council and Vastint are also working together to agree a demolition and remediation strategy for the overall site, as well as how key infrastructure requirements for the site, such as services, access roads, public realm etc., will be delivered and funded.
11. Previous planning permission for the Dumballs Road site gave permission for the following: over 2,000 new homes, including 12.5% affordable housing; over 400,000 sq. ft. commercial space, circa 30,000 sq. ft. of retail space and other community facilities.
12. Vastint have worked in partnership with the Council to develop new proposals that build on some of the key development principles already established through the planning process, including:
 - Integration of sustainable travel opportunities
 - Maximising the potential of the river frontage
 - Providing high quality urban public spaces
 - Providing high quality standards of design.

13. The previous report to Cabinet on 1 December 2016 highlighted that:

'Vastint is keen to explore a greater level and mix of employment uses given the proximity of the site to the city centre and in particular will explore the potential to provide commercial business space for smaller end users to complement the large office developments being brought forward on adjacent sites at Central Square, Central Quay, Callaghan Square and Capital Quarter.'

'Vastint is also committed to delivering community benefits through their developments and will again work with the Council to maximise apprenticeship and training opportunities, particularly for young people.'

14. The development of a master plan will pave the way for discussions to be held on the finer details of proposals. These will culminate in a new planning

application being submitted to the Local Planning Authority.

15. In terms of the financial contribution of the Council, Cabinet agreed at their meeting on 1 December 2016 to purchase land at Dumballs Road to assist in progressing the scheme, using funds allocated in the Council's Capital Programme for the Cardiff Enterprise Zone. In addition, the financial implications section of the report to Cabinet 1 December 2016 stated that the Council would become responsible for 'vacant site holding costs', which would crystallise incrementally as landowners transfer their operations to alternative premises elsewhere in the city. These costs would be met from the Cardiff Enterprise Zone Corporate Revenue Budget.

Way Forward

16. Andrew Cobden, Managing Director - Vastint, and Michael Cronin, Property Manager - Vastint, will attend to give a presentation on their emerging proposals for regenerating Dumballs Road.
17. Councillor Russell Goodway (Cabinet Member – Investment and Development) and Neil Hanratty (Director – Economic Development) will attend and may wish to make a statement.
18. Members will have the opportunity to ask questions to the above panel of witnesses. Members are reminded that the scope of this scrutiny is to focus on the proposals for redeveloping the site that fall within the terms of reference of this Committee, for example:
 - commercial units
 - employment & training opportunities
 - community space
 - contribution to the wider economy of Cardiff
 - financial contribution of the Council
 - liaison processes with businesses.
19. Members may also wish to explore the following issues:
 - Mechanisms for community consultation

- Interface with other economic development projects
- Timescales
- Whether there are any risks to the Council
- How any risks to the Council are being addressed and mitigated.

Legal Implications

20. The Scrutiny Committee is empowered to enquire, consider, review and recommend but not to make policy decisions. As the recommendations in this report are to consider and review matters there are no direct legal implications. However, legal implications may arise if and when the matters under review are implemented with or without any modifications. Any report with recommendations for decision that goes to Cabinet/Council will set out any legal implications arising from those recommendations. All decisions taken by or on behalf of the Council must (a) be within the legal powers of the Council; (b) comply with any procedural requirement imposed by law; (c) be within the powers of the body or person exercising powers on behalf of the Council; (d) be undertaken in accordance with the procedural requirements imposed by the Council e.g. Scrutiny Procedure Rules; (e) be fully and properly informed; (f) be properly motivated; (g) be taken having regard to the Council's fiduciary duty to its taxpayers; and (h) be reasonable and proper in all the circumstances.

Financial Implications

21. The Scrutiny Committee is empowered to enquire, consider, review and recommend but not to make policy decisions. As the recommendations in this report are to consider and review matters there are no direct financial implications at this stage in relation to any of the work programme. However, financial implications may arise if and when the matters under review are implemented with or without any modifications. Any report with recommendations for decision that goes to Cabinet/Council will set out any financial implications arising from those recommendations.

Recommendation

The Committee is recommended to:

- i) Consider and note the information presented in this report and the information presented at the meeting, and
- ii) Determine any comments, observations or recommendations to the Cabinet.

Davina Fiore
Director, Governance and Legal Services
5 October 2018

Mae'r dudalen hon yn wag yn fwriadol

**CYNGOR CAERDYDD
CARDIFF COUNCIL****ECONOMY & CULTURE SCRUTINY COMMITTEE****11 OCTOBER 2018**

**CABINET RESPONSE TO THE REPORT BY THE ECONOMY & CULTURE
SCRUTINY COMMITTEE INQUIRY – FUNDING OF PARKS IN CARDIFF**

Purpose of report

1. To update Members on the Cabinet response to the recommendations made in the Economy & Culture Scrutiny Committee April 2018 inquiry report 'Funding of Parks in Cardiff'.

Background

2. As a part of the Economy and Culture Scrutiny Committee work programme for 2017-18, the Committee agreed to consider the funding of Parks in Cardiff as a topic for in-depth scrutiny. The following terms of reference were used:

- | |
|--|
| <ol style="list-style-type: none">1. To investigate how best to increase the sustainability of funding for Parks in Cardiff by:<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Exploring how best to increase income generation by Parks, including considering commercialisation, events, sponsorship and alternative funding models• Exploring how best to reduce costs of managing and developing Parks by improving operational efficiencies, utilising work undertaken by the service area, informed by action planning, and service reviews undertaken as part of the Infrastructure Alternative Delivery Models work stream, i.e. consideration of statutory and non-statutory service provision, scale, volume and quality of service provision and partnership working |
|--|

- Utilising the lessons learnt regarding funding of parks in comparable cities across the UK
 - Examining Parks funding models successfully used elsewhere across the World to test whether these are transferable to Cardiff.
2. To gather stakeholders views with regard to the above, including customers, partners, third sector organisations and relevant Cabinet Members and Cardiff Council officers.
 3. To make evidence based recommendations to improve the future security of funding for Parks in Cardiff in a time of austerity.

3. Members received evidence from a range of sources, including Cabinet Members, senior officers, officers from relevant departments, Friends of Parks Groups, Innovate Trust Green Days project manager, Cardiff Civic Society, Llandaff Fields Hub Committee and wildlife partner organisations including RSPB, Wildlife Trust of South and West Wales and Buglife Cymru.
4. The task group invited written submissions from sports pitch users and received evidence from Cardiff University Sports Development Officer, Cardiff Combination Football League (Adults) and Chairperson of Pontprennau Pumas Junior and Mini Football Club, Llandaff RFC and Rhiwbina RFC.
5. The task group also received evidence from desk-based research looking at approaches taken elsewhere in the U.K., North America and Australia with regard to reducing costs and generating income as well as alternative approaches to funding parks.
6. The evidence was used to identify suitable findings from the Inquiry, and to develop recommendations based on the evidence heard throughout the Inquiry
7. The report for this task and finish inquiry was taken to the Cabinet meeting held on 17 May 2018. The full report for this inquiry can be found at:

<http://cardiff.moderngov.co.uk/ieListDocuments.aspx?CId=151&MId=3084&LLL=0>

Cabinet Response to Recommendations

8. The Cabinet agreed their response at their meeting on 20 September 2018. Attached at **Appendix 1** is a full copy of the Cabinet paper, outlining the recommendations made and the Cabinet response to each recommendation.
9. Overall, the Committee made 13 recommendations to the Cabinet. The Cabinet response shows that:
 - 9 of the recommendations are accepted – *R1, R3, R4, R5, R7, R8, R9, R12, R13*
 - 3 of the recommendations are partially accepted – *R2, R6, R10* :
 - *R2* – recommended ensuring that the scale and scope of required income generation and cost reduction in Parks reflects the impact of the reduction in available Commuted Sums for Parks Services and that a plan be put in place to mitigate the impact of this reduction.
 - *R6* – recommended officers to expedite the application to Welsh Government for funding for energy efficiency measures at Bute Park nursery
 - *R10* – parts a) and b) are rejected, which were for income earned from concessions in Parks to go into the Parks budget and for costs incurred from undertaking work for Highways to be reimbursed to the Parks budget
 - 1 recommendation was not accepted – *R11*:
 - *R11* - this was in relation to there being no further cuts to park keeping budgets, which is the budget that pays for urban and community park rangers.
10. Attached at **Appendix 2** is a full copy of the press release issued by the Council highlighting the response being taken to Cabinet and thanking scrutiny for its hard work and for bringing useful ideas to the table.

Way Forward

11. Councillor Peter Bradbury (Cabinet Member – Culture and), Neil Hanratty (Director – Economic Development) and Steve Morris (Parks & Sport Development Manager) have been invited to present the response to the inquiry and present any progress made in addressing the issues raised and recommendations approved.

Legal Implications

12. The Scrutiny Committee is empowered to enquire, consider, review and recommend but not to make policy decisions. As the recommendations in this report are to consider and review matters there are no direct legal implications. However, legal implications may arise if and when the matters under review are implemented with or without any modifications. Any report with recommendations for decision that goes to Cabinet/Council will set out any legal implications arising from those recommendations. All decisions taken by or on behalf of the Council must (a) be within the legal powers of the Council; (b) comply with any procedural requirement imposed by law; (c) be within the powers of the body or person exercising powers on behalf of the Council; (d) be undertaken in accordance with the procedural requirements imposed by the Council e.g. Scrutiny Procedure Rules; (e) be fully and properly informed; (f) be properly motivated; (g) be taken having regard to the Council's fiduciary duty to its taxpayers; and (h) be reasonable and proper in all the circumstances.

Financial Implications

13. The Scrutiny Committee is empowered to enquire, consider, review and recommend but not to make policy decisions. As the recommendations in this report are to consider and review matters there are no direct financial implications at this stage in relation to any of the work programme. However, financial implications may arise if and when the matters under review are implemented with or without any modifications. Any report with

recommendations for decision that goes to Cabinet/Council will set out any financial implications arising from those recommendations.

Recommendation

The Committee is recommended to receive the Cabinet response and agree the way forward for receiving progress reports on the work required to implement the agreed recommendations.

DAVINA FIORE

Director of Governance & Legal Services

5 October 2018

The following Appendices are attached:

Appendix 1: Cabinet Response to the Report by the Economy and Culture Scrutiny Committee entitled “Funding of Parks in Cardiff”

Appendix 2: Press release from Cardiff Council, titled ‘Safeguarding our Parks to be discussed at Cabinet’.

Mae'r dudalen hon yn wag yn fwriadol

CABINET MEETING: 20 SEPTEMBER 2018

**CABINET RESPONSE TO THE ECONOMY & CULTURE
SCRUTINY COMMITTEE REPORT ENTITLED 'FUNDING OF
PARKS'**

CULTURE & LEISURE (COUNCILLOR PETER BRADBURY)

AGENDA ITEM: 3

Reason for this Report

1. To respond to a report published by the Economy & Culture Scrutiny Committee in April 2018, entitled 'Funding for Parks'.

Background

2. In the Autumn of 2017 a task group comprising Members of the Economy & Culture Scrutiny Committee was established to conduct an Inquiry into how the Council, against the backdrop of unprecedented financial challenges can continue to provide excellent Parks and Green Spaces consistent with its Capital Ambition.
3. To consider the issues and deliver the report, a project management approach designed to enable effective scrutiny was implemented and extensive consultation with wide and diverse stakeholder groups was undertaken over time.

Issues

4. The inquiry sought to explore opportunities and options for increasing the sustainability of funding for Parks by:
 - Increasing income through commercialisation, events, sponsorship and alternative funding models
 - Achieving cost reductions / improving operational efficiencies
 - Benchmarking / comparison with core cities and others comparable, utilising lessons learnt and best practice
 - Examining funding models worldwide, testing transferability
5. Cabinet recognises the value that it's Parks and Green Spaces provide to the residents of and visitors to our City and understands the positive contribution that stakeholder groups can make on a number of levels. However, given the predicted scale of savings to be found in the medium

term the Council will be required to take some difficult decisions in respect of the types of functions delivered and the standard / level of service provided.

6. The report makes thirteen recommendations nine of which are accepted, three partially accepted and one rejected.

Reason for Recommendation

7. To enable the Cabinet to respond to the report published by the Economy & Culture Scrutiny Committee of April 2018 entitled "Funding of Parks".

Financial Implications

8. The Cabinet response outlined in Appendix A highlights that any growth and / or financial pressures that the Parks Service faces will be managed through the normal Council budgetary processes. With regard to Recommendation 6, any savings resulting from the ReFit funded energy efficiency measures will be after deducting loan repayments. In the case of Recommendation 13, any additional resources and / or time required will be funded from existing resources.

Legal Implications

9. There are no legal implications arising from this report.

RECOMMENDATION

Cabinet is recommended to agree the response to the report of the Economy & Culture Scrutiny Committee entitled " Funding of Parks " as set out in Appendix A.

SENIOR RESPONSIBLE OFFICER	Neil Hanratty Director Economic Development
	14 September 2018

The following appendix is attached:

Appendix A : Cabinet Response to the Report published by the Economy & Culture Scrutiny Committee of April 2018 entitled ' Funding of Parks'.

**CABINET RESPONSE TO THE REPORT OF THE ECONOMY &
CULTURE SCRUTINY COMMITTEE ENTITLED "FUNDING OF PARKS"**

Recommendation 1

Cabinet agrees a clear vision statement for the Parks Service that defines its purpose, focus and direction and thereby determines the scale and scope of required income generation and cost reduction.

RESPONSE : The recommendation is accepted.

Recommendation 2

The vision statement for Parks Services, and consequent scale and scope of required income generation and cost reduction, reflects the impact of the reduction in available Commuted Sums for Parks Services and that a plan be put in place to mitigate the impact of this reduction.

RESPONSE : The recommendation is partially accepted.

The Council will endeavour to mitigate the impacts of the reduction in commuted sum payments and through the budgetary framework / budget setting process for 2020/21 and beyond.

Recommendation 3

Cabinet tasks officers to undertake an options appraisal of the potential mechanisms to generate income and reduce costs, with the evaluation criteria to include: the fit of the mechanism with the agreed vision statement for Parks Services; anticipated amount of income generated; ease of generating income; availability of resources required; impact on existing services; and level of risk.

RESPONSE : The recommendation is accepted.

The report sets out the progress made to date in reducing costs and increasing income, over time. Many of the mechanisms identified within the report for achieving such have been implemented as part of previous budget rounds with savings generated. Action plans based on functions

of the parks service are in place and those opportunities identified through options appraisal will be incorporated into these action plans. Some of the opportunities for income generation / cost reduction are also being explored through the service review, which is currently being undertaken by the Capital Ambition Delivery Team.

Recommendation 4

Cabinet tasks officers to use the evidence provided by this Inquiry to inform the options appraisal of the mechanisms identified as able to deliver savings/ generate income.

RESPONSE : The recommendation is accepted.

The evidence generated through the scrutiny exercise can be used along with other sources of evidence that the service obtains from stakeholders / comparators.

Recommendation 5

Cabinet tasks officers to develop a detailed plan for implementing the preferred mechanisms identified by the option appraisal that sets out the resources identified to achieve implementation and resultant timescales.

RESPONSE : The recommendation is accepted.

In line with the response to Recommendation 3, action plans based on functions of the parks service are in place and those opportunities identified through the options appraisal will be incorporated into these action plans.

Recommendation 6

Cabinet, ahead of the options appraisal as a matter of urgency, tasks officers to expedite the application for Welsh Government grant funding for energy efficiency measures at Bute Park nursery.

RESPONSE : The recommendation is partially accepted.

The Welsh Government funding available takes the form of an interest free invest to save scheme, £ 2 Million has been secured for Phase II of the Scheme and the Bute Park Nursery is a candidate building under the re-fit framework for this phase. The identification of buildings to be taken forward under Phase II will be determined by Asset Management Board in September 2018.

Recommendation 7

Cabinet ensures that any additional concessions in Parks are of a high standard, sustainable and add to the reputation of Cardiff's parks.

RESPONSE : The recommendation is accepted.

Recommendation 8

Cabinet tasks officers to liaise with the sports pitch users' representatives that responded to this Inquiry expressing an interest in taking on responsibility for grounds maintenance and land management, with a view to establishing viable key holder agreements, leases and/ or asset transfer arrangements that deliver savings/ generate income for Parks Services.

RESPONSE : The recommendation is accepted.

A wide range of agreements have been reached, over time with sports clubs, local leagues, governing bodies and the private sector. These agreements have enabled the Council to reduce costs, attract investment in infrastructure / facilities and have ensured the sustainability of sporting provision. The service will continue to respond to interest from users.

Recommendation 9

Cabinet considers smaller events utilise sites throughout the city, including school sites subject to the approval of their governing bodies, taking into account sustainable travel plans, hard surfaces/ standing and utility requirements.

RESPONSE : The recommendation is accepted.

Such sites will be considered in conjunction with event promoters / organisers taking into account the nature and scale of the specific event and its requirements.

Recommendation 10

Budget realignment takes place as a matter of urgency to ensure that the Parks Services budget reflects the true position in terms of income generated and costs incurred, to include:

- a. The income earned from concessions in Parks goes into the Parks budget, rather than the central corporate pot
- b. The costs incurred by undertaking works for Highways are reimbursed to the Parks budget
- c. The charges from CTS reflect the work undertaken and the reduction in the number of Parks vehicles.

RESPONSE : The recommendation is partially accepted.

- a. The income earned from concessions in Parks goes into the Parks budget, rather than the central corporate pot.
This recommendation is rejected, the current arrangements for income relating to parks based concessions follow the Corporate Landlord approach agreed previously by Cabinet.
- b. The costs incurred by undertaking works for Highways are reimbursed to the Parks budget.
The recommendation is rejected - The cost of highway related grounds maintenance works, undertaken by the parks service should be noted and needs to be separated in calculations that show the cost of the parks service. Notwithstanding this the impact of reimbursing such will apply pressures elsewhere.
- c. The charges from CTS reflect the work undertaken and the reduction in the number of Parks vehicles.
The recommendation is accepted – A reconciliation of accounts has been completed.

Recommendation 11

There are no further cuts to the park keeping budget (which covers the park ranger services) and that the Cabinet identifies mechanisms to increase the budget available to park rangers, as their services are vital to ensure Cardiff's parks are safe, secure, well managed, inclusive and of a high quality for the residents and visitors to Cardiff. Members are particularly mindful that park rangers enable Friends Groups to contribute thousands of hours of volunteer time and expertise, which is critical to

sustaining the excellence of Cardiff's Parks and Green Spaces.

RESPONSE : The recommendation is rejected.

The important role played by the Park Ranger Service is both understood and valued, any growth and / or financial pressures that the service faces will be managed through normal budget processes. Cabinet cannot allow budget decisions to be tied into specific Scrutiny recommendations.

Recommendation 12

A communication plan be developed and implemented to ensure that there is a shared understanding of the vision and direction for Parks Services amongst staff, partners, businesses and residents.

RESPONSE : This recommendation is accepted.

Recommendation 13

In order to develop the vision statement, deliver agreed recommendations and any other work arising from the agreed vision statement, Cabinet ensure that the Operational Manager time available for Parks is increased, along with other resources as required.

RESPONSE : The recommendation is accepted.

Mae'r dudalen hon yn wag yn fwriadol

Downloaded 4 October 2018

Safeguarding our parks to be discussed at Cabinet

How to safeguard Cardiff's parks and green spaces for future generations in the face of huge budget and financial pressures will be discussed at the next meeting of the council's Cabinet when it considers recommendations made by the Economy and Culture Scrutiny Committee report 'Funding for Parks'.

The Scrutiny report outlined a series of recommendations including:

- Increasing income through commercialisation, events, sponsorship and alternative funding models.
- Opening discussions with sports pitch users around taking on responsibility for grounds maintenance in a Community Asset Transfer type model.
- Consideration to offer smaller sites for events use across the city.

Cabinet Member for Leisure and Culture, Cllr Peter Bradbury said: "This report has brought some really good ideas to the table and I am grateful to scrutiny for the hard work which has gone into it.

"We all appreciate the natural splendour of Cardiff's parks and green spaces and this authority has been working hard in the face of huge budget cuts to protect and fund these important public assets. In fact we now have 12 Green Flag parks in the city, more than at any other time.

"None of this would have been possible without the dedicated work of our parks staff, park rangers and our invaluable friends groups. However, as budgets continue to shrink it's even more likely we will have to call on our residents to help us maintain these beautiful spaces

for future generations. Even something as simple as taking your litter home or popping any litter you see lying around into a bin can help our parks stay green and beautiful.

"The Scrutiny report has come up with some really worthwhile recommendations which we will pursue. Of course in recent years there have been a number of new projects which have had a positive impact on the way parks are run, generating income for the Council by hosting events in Bute Park and selling plants at the Council nursery.

"Using the knowledge and experience we've gained from these projects we must now look forward at further developing options and opportunities so that our coveted parks and green spaces can continue to thrive during a period of financial austerity."

The Scrutiny Report has made 13 recommendations. Council's Cabinet has agreed 10 and partially agreed 2.

**CYNGOR CAERDYDD
CARDIFF COUNCIL**

ECONOMY & CULTURE SCRUTINY COMMITTEE

11 OCTOBER 2018

COMMITTEE BUSINESS REPORT

Background

1. This report provides a correspondence update and seeks Committee's approval for the terms of reference and project plan for an 'Events in Cardiff' Inquiry, attached at **Appendix A**.

Correspondence update

2. Following most Committee meetings the Chair writes a letter to the relevant Cabinet Member or officer, summing up the Committee's comments and recommendations regarding the issues considered.
3. At the Committee meeting on 14 June 2018 Members received a report detailing the correspondence sent and received up to that meeting. Since then, correspondence has been sent following the Committee meeting on 14 June 2018 and a forum meeting of the Committee on 20 August 2018. There were no letters resulting from Committee on 13 September 2018.
4. The list below details the position with regard to responses to correspondence:
 - i. *Response Received* – from Councillor Goodway to the Chair's letter following scrutiny of Economic Development Quarter 4 performance, considered at Committee on 14 June 2018; the letter requested further information re proposals for St Mary's Street.

- ii. *No Response Required* – from Councillor Merry and Councillor Thorne to the Chair’s letter following scrutiny of Communities & Housing Quarter 4 performance, considered at Committee on 14 June 2018.
 - iii. *No Response Required* – from Councillor Thomas to the Chair’s letter regarding Cardiff Capital Region City Deal Joint Overview and Scrutiny Committee, considered at Committee on 14 June 2018.
 - iv. *Response Received* – from Welsh Government, confirming that the Chair’s letter detailing the Committee’s views on proposed changes to Adult Community Learning funding will be included as a consultation response, following consideration of the proposed changes at a forum meeting of the Committee on 20 August 2018.
5. Copies of the Chair’s letters and any responses received can be found on the Council’s website page for the relevant Committee meeting, with a hyperlink provided at the top of the page, entitled ‘*correspondence following the committee meeting*’.

Events in Cardiff Inquiry

6. At the Committee Meeting on 13 September 2018, Members agreed their work programme, which included holding an inquiry into Events in Cardiff. The Committee agreed the following membership for this task group: Councillor Gordon; Councillor Henshaw; and Councillor Parkhill.
7. The task group has met to undertake initial scoping work, resulting in proposed terms of reference and a project plan. These have been discussed with the Head of Culture, Venues and Events, who has contributed to the identification of relevant stakeholders and has discussed the proposed terms of reference and project plan with relevant Cabinet Members.
8. The resultant draft scoping document, containing terms of reference and project plan, is attached at **Appendix A**, for Committee Members consideration and amendment.

Way Forward

9. During their meeting, Members may wish to:
 - i. reflect on the correspondence update; and
 - ii. consider the draft terms of reference and project plan for the Events Inquiry, attached at **Appendix A**, and suggest any amendments required.

Legal Implications

10. The Scrutiny Committee is empowered to enquire, consider, review and recommend but not to make policy decisions. As the recommendations in this report are to consider and review matters there are no direct legal implications. However, legal implications may arise if and when the matters under review are implemented with or without any modifications. Any report with recommendations for decision that goes to Cabinet/Council will set out any legal implications arising from those recommendations. All decisions taken by or on behalf of the Council must (a) be within the legal powers of the Council; (b) comply with any procedural requirement imposed by law; (c) be within the powers of the body or person exercising powers on behalf of the Council; (d) be undertaken in accordance with the procedural requirements imposed by the Council e.g. Scrutiny Procedure Rules; (e) be fully and properly informed; (f) be properly motivated; (g) be taken having regard to the Council's fiduciary duty to its taxpayers; and (h) be reasonable and proper in all the circumstances.

Financial Implications

11. The Scrutiny Committee is empowered to enquire, consider, review and recommend but not to make policy decisions. As the recommendations in this report are to consider and review matters there are no direct financial implications at this stage in relation to any of the work programme. However, financial implications may arise if and when the matters under review are implemented with or without any modifications. Any report with recommendations for decision that goes to Cabinet/Council will set out any financial implications arising from those recommendations.

RECOMMENDATIONS

The Committee is recommended to:

- I. Note the consultation update and consider any further correspondence required; and
- II. Consider, if necessary amend, and approve the terms of reference and project plan for the Events Inquiry, attached at **Appendix A**.

Davina Fiore

Director of Governance & Legal Services

5 October 2018

ECONOMY & CULTURE SCRUTINY COMMITTEE

PROPOSED TOPIC:	EVENTS IN CARDIFF
Proposed Terms of Reference	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • To explore with key stakeholders what the programme of events in Cardiff should look like, taking into account the following factors: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Role of events re economy of city and region ○ Impact of events on citizens, the council and the city. • To explore with key stakeholders what the Council’s role should be re events, looking in particular at: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Role of Council and Partner organisations re attracting, promoting, delivering, managing and retaining events. ○ How much Council resource should be focused on events? ○ How other Councils manage similar programmes of events. • To make evidence- based recommendations on a future events strategy for Cardiff and the role of the Council re events in Cardiff.
Number of meetings required	
Meeting 1	<p>Setting the Context & Identifying Lines of Enquiry</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - To consider a briefing report giving an overview of Events in Cardiff – <i>i.e. UK and WG strategy, policy and funding of events; schedule of events in Cardiff; how Events are attracted, promoted, delivered and managed; an overview of Council’s Events team (budgets, staffing, premises, PI results, partnership working); and any other relevant information</i> - To deliberate the next steps in the investigation and lines of enquiry to explore with witnesses
Meeting 2 & Meeting 3	<p>Obtaining views from External Stakeholders –</p> <p>Invite the following:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Welsh Govt. – Major Events Team and Visit Wales/ Sell Wales to the World - Arts Council of Wales - Police & Health – Events Management - Cardiff Hoteliers Association - Sound Diplomacy - For Cardiff – BID - FSB - Stevens and Associates
Meeting 4	<p>Consider Good Practice and other evidence –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Other local authorities – good practice models of managing events - Written evidence received from venues – invitation to submit response to be sent to the following external stakeholders: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ WMC/ Motorpoint Arena/ Principality Stadium/ SWALEC Stadium/ Cardiff City Stadium/Tramshed/ Depot. - Other information gathered to inform Inquiry, including any evidence relating to impact of events on citizens.

4.SS.01c	Issue 2	Date: 08/06	Process Owner: Chief Officer Scrutiny, Change & Efficiency	Authorisation: Scrutiny OM	Page 1 of 1
----------	---------	-------------	--	----------------------------	-------------

Meeting 5	Planning meeting - to deliberate what has been considered to date and the next steps in the investigation
Meeting 6	<p>Obtain views from Internal Witnesses</p> <p><i>To invite Cllr Bradbury, Cllr Goodway, Neil Hanratty and Kathryn Richards to give their views on:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - What the programme of events in Cardiff should look like - What the Council's role should be re events - Any specific queries that have arisen following evidence received during the Inquiry – <i>these to be relayed to witnesses before the meeting.</i>
Meeting 7	Sum Up Meeting – consideration of all information received during the Inquiry, identify Key Findings and agree way forward for draft report/recommendations
Meeting 8	Consideration of draft report and recommendations

Proposed Reporting Arrangements

- Investigation to be undertaken between October 2018 and December 2018
- Report to be considered by the Scrutiny Committee – 17 January 2019
- Report from Scrutiny to Cabinet - January 2019

Potential Outputs/Outcomes from this investigation

- Key stakeholders are given the opportunity to contribute to the Inquiry.
- Evidence based recommendations on the future Events Strategy for Cardiff
- Evidence based recommendations on the future role of the Council re Events

4.SS.01c	Issue 2	Date: 08/06	Process Owner: Chief Officer Scrutiny, Change & Efficiency	Authorisation: Scrutiny OM	Page 2 of 1
----------	---------	-------------	---	-------------------------------	-------------